Katarzyna Kubacka
United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
k.kubacka@unesco.org

Education for the Promotion of Culture of Lawfulness: The Role of Global Citizenship Education and Social and Emotional Skills

Abstract: The relationship between education and peace is a complex one. The article discusses how education can be the driver of peace and Culture of Lawfulness or, if used to propagate intolerance or prejudice, it can also fuel injustice. Throughout its content, the article looks at the issue of Culture of Lawfulness through the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG), particularly from the SDG 4 perspective. The article focuses on the role education can play in advancing the Culture of Lawfulness. In particular, the article discusses the development of Global Citizenship Education (GCE) as an important tool for Culture of Lawfulness. Furthermore, the article also highlights the role of students' social and emotional skills', also known as non-cognitive skills, and the development through GCE teaching and learning, in their lawful behaviour. Teachers are considered key actors of change and much attention should be given to their training needs, both on the initial training level, as well as through continuous professional development.
Keywords: Global Citizenship Education, Culture of Lawfulness, Sustainable Development Goals, social and emotional skills, non-cognitive skills, peace, education

1. Introduction

In December 2017, the United Nations General Assembly decided that the theme of the Fourteenth United Nations Congress on Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice shall be: "Advancing crime prevention, criminal justice and the rule of law: towards the achievement of the 2030 Agenda" (A/RES/72/192). Within this theme, "education and youth engagement as key to making societies resilient to crime" will be one of the areas covered during the Fourteenth Congress[1]. This article discusses

---

1   E/CN.15/2018/CRP.1, Discussion guide for the Fourteenth United Nations Congress on Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice, Vienna, 9.02.2018.

the role that education can play in the creation, support and advancement of the culture of lawfulness. In particular, the author, from the perspective of the United Nations Scientific, Educational and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), looks at how its concept of Global Citizenship Education (GCE) and the development of social and emotional skills such as empathy, critical thinking and communication through GCE, can contribute to that goal.

The challenges of the globally interconnected and interdependent world, such as poverty, conflict, inequality; underpin the importance of a transformative education approach, such as GCE. With the United Nation's Sustainable Development Goal 4, GCE is mentioned in target 4.7, together with Education for Sustainable Development (ESD). Both types of education are seen as important educational goals to ensure the world moves forward in peace and sustainable prosperity.

2. The relationship between education, peace and lawfulness

The connection between lawfulness, or its opposite, crime, and peace has been notably made by Richard Quinney who drew on different peacemaking traditions, including humanist, feminist and critical, as a basis for criminology of peacemaking. In that context, crime is connected to suffering, and thus crime can be ended only when suffering ends, and there is peace[2]. Education that promotes peace and compassion can be a tool to promote lawfulness. In addition, providing education for those who lack it is, in itself, one way to minimise their suffering[3]. The relationship between education and peace can be complex. Education, when narrow in its scope, or when it excludes groups of society, can be a tool for exclusion and prejudice. For instance, inequality in terms of prolonged lack of education access or low education quality, can be associated with civic unrest. For example, in Sierra Leone, those who received no education were nine times more likely than those with post-primary education to join the Revolutionary United Front (RUF), a group whose cross-border invasion started the conflict in 2001[4]. In addition, there is a bi-directional relationship to conflict in education. Just as limited or inequitable access to education can drive conflict, conflict further reduces students' access to education. Girls' access to and attendance in schooling is particularly likely to suffer, even more so than that of boys[5].

---

2   R. Quinney, The Way of Peace: On Crime, Suffering and Service, (in:) H. Pepinsky and R. Quinney (ed), Criminology as Peacemaking. Bloomington 1991, pp. 3-13.

3   *Ibidem.*

4   H. Macartan, J. M. Weinstein, Who Fights? The Determinants of Participation in Civil War. "American Journal of Political Science" 2008, vol. 52, no. 2, p. 436-55.

5   D. Burde, A. Kapit, R. L. Wahl, O. Guven, M. I. Skarpeteig, Education in Emergencies: A Review of Theory and Research, "Review of Educational Research" 2016, vol. 87, no. 3, p. 619-58.

Education is also likely to hinder cohesion and undermine the rule of law when curricula and learning materials offer stereotypical and prejudicial depictions of certain social groups and thus exacerbate social divisions[6]. For instance, in pre-genocide Rwanda Hutu-dominated governments channelled prejudice against Tutsis using school materials, among others. Textbooks spread the depiction of Tutsis as outsiders who had conquered the country and oppressed the Hutu tribe[7]. In Pakistan, research shows that textbooks tend to emphasise the war with India and underplay any peace initiatives. In addition, materials related to non-Islamic faiths and non-Muslims channelled mistrust and inferiority of other faiths. The portrayals predisposed students to think that non-Muslim populations of Pakistan were outsiders and unpatriotic[8].

On the other hand, education can transform lives and contribute to building peaceful and cohesive societies. For instance, those who are educated are also less likely to be in conflict with the law. In 2001, more than 75 per cent of convicted individuals in Italy had not completed high school[9]. Among Swedes born in 1943-1955, individuals with at least one conviction had on average 0.7 years less of schooling completed, than those without any convictions[10]. These positive educational effects can occur due to a number of factors. For instance, greater investment in education might serve as a deterrent to engagement in crime for fear of losing them[11]. Furthermore the content of education and the skills it teaches can make a difference, also in terms of reducing conflict[12].

The Global Education Monitoring Report (GEM Report)[13] devoted ample space to links between education and peace. On the topic of peace and education,

---

6   UNESCO, Global Education Monitoring Report 2016. Education for People and Planet: Creatng Sustainable Futures for All, UNESCO, Paris 2016.

7   E. King, From Classroom to Conflict in Rwanda, New York 2014.

8   USIFR, Teaching Intolerance in Pakistan: Religious Bias in Public School Textbooks, Islamabad 2016.

9   P. Buonanno, L. Leonida, Education and Crime: Evidence from Italian Regions, "Applied Economics Letters" 2006, vol. 13, p. 709-13.

10   R. Hjalmarsson, H. Holmlund, M. Lindquist, The Effect of Education on Criminal Convictions and Incarceration: Causal Evidence from Micro-Data, "Centre for Economic Policy Research" Discussion Paper no. 8646 2011.

11   R. Hjalmarsson, L. Lochner, The Impact of Education on Crime: International Evidence, CEDifo DICE Report 2/2012, Washington, D.C. 2014.

12   D. Burde…, op.cit.

13   The Global Education Monitoring Report (or GEM Report), formerly known as the Education for All Global Monitoring Report (GMR), is an editorially independent, authoritative, and evidence-based annual report that monitors progress in education in the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), which have been adopted as part of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. The Report is funded by a group of governments, multilateral agencies and foundations and published annually by UNESCO to serve the international community. It is widely recognised as an indispensable advocacy and technical tool supporting the achievement of SDG 4, which aims to

the Report noted that governments needed to invest in quality civic education programmes and curricula, which contribute to a well-functioning justice system, including participation and access for marginalized communities. It also urged the expansion of, and emphasis on, global citizenship education in curricula[14].

3. The role of Global Citizenship Education in building the Culture of Lawfulness

Global Citizen Education (GCE) is a contested term that is often misunderstood, or is functioning under many different names. The first issue comes with the understanding of the term "global citizenship". It is important to emphasise that global citizenship does not refer to the legal status of citizenship. In the context of GCE, UNESCO has defined it as referring to a: "a sense of belonging to a broader community and common humanity, promoting a 'global gaze' that links the local to the global and the national to the international. It is also a way of understanding, acting and relating oneself to others and the environment in space and in time, based on universal values, through respect for diversity and pluralism. In this context, each individual's life has implications in day-to-day decisions that connect the global with the local, and vice versa"[15].

Analogically, GCE has been defined as education that: "highlights essential functions of education related to the formation of citizenship [in relation] with globalization. It is a concern with the relevance of knowledge, skills and values for the participation of citizens in, and their contribution to, dimensions of societal development which are linked at local and global levels. It is directly related to the civic, social and political socialization function of education, and ultimately to the contribution of education in preparing children and young people to deal with the challenges of today's increasingly interconnected and interdependent world"[16]. Its goal is to: "enrich the concepts and content of all subjects and fields of education by widening their dimensions. Through the process, learners and educators examine the roots and causes of events and developments at the local level, consider the connections with the global level, and identify possible solutions. This investigation of the relationship between micro- and macro-level issues and developments is a critical element in equipping learners to fulfil their potential in a fast-changing and

---

ensure "inclusive and equitable quality education" and promote "lifelong learning for all" by 2030. With its renewed mandate, established in the Incheon Declaration of the World Education Forum in May 2015, the annual GEM Report series will identify effective education policies and analyse major education related themes.

14   UNESCO, 2016…, *op. cit.*

15   UNESCO, Global Citizenship Education: Preparing Learners for the Challenges of the 21st Century, UNESCO, Paris 2014, p. 14.

16   *Ibidem,* p. 15.

interdependent world"[17]. Thus, GCE advances a set of attitudes and motivations, as well as knowledge sharing in a global context. These are meant to inspire a critical thinking approach and behaviours cognisant of the cultural differences and the interconnections of the global world.

Recognising the importance of GCE and what it represents for the idea of culture of lawfulness, UNESCO and UNODC have launched an initiative combining the expertise on the two areas in the respective organisations. The partner agreement on the Initiative on Global Citizenship Education for establishing a culture of lawfulness was signed in December 2017. The first expert consultation meeting was held in March 2018. The initiative will span the following two years. It is supported by the State of Qatar and aims at: "equipping primary and secondary level educators with tools to uphold the principles of human rights and democracy, as well as to preserve and strengthen democratic institutions and the rule of law"[18].

It is important to note that, while GCE can be part of the curricula as a stand-alone subject, it can also be mainstreamed across different subjects. Namely, core GCE ideas of global interconnectedness can be incorporated in different classes throughout the whole curricula. This method involves taking the GCE approach in all subjects.

Countries increasingly include the themes of global citizenship education in their civic education programmes. A recent report on the state of civic education in Europe covered the models of how civic education is included in curricula and the extent to which global aspects are covered differs between countries. The report found that in some countries inclusion of global themes is part of a transition from old ways of thinking toward new curricula. For instance in Austria, the 2016 curriculum reform strengthened the themes of human rights and global and European citizenship[19].

In addition, GCE can be fostered with approaches outside of the classroom and within life-long learning. A review of extracurricular activities around the world found that well-designed approaches which are open and accessible to all individuals, can promote the ideas of global citizenship. These programmes can improve conflict resolution, social cohesion and increase awareness about legal frameworks and human rights and allow for communication and understanding across borders or cultures[20].

---

17   *Ibidem,* p. 15 .
18   UNODC, Global Citizenship Education for a Culture of Lawfulness initiative begins its work, UNODC, Vienna 2018, https://www.unodc.org/dohadeclaration/en/news/2018/03/global-citizenship-education-for-a-culture-of-lawfulness-initiative-begins-its-work.html (17.05.2018).
19   European Commission/EACEA/Eurydice, Citizenship Education at School in Europe 2017, Eurydice Report, Luxembourg 2017.
20   B. Akar, Developing a Monitoring Instrument to Measure Extracurricular and Non-Formal Activities which Promote Global Citizenship Education (GCED) and Education for Sustainable

4. Global Citizenship Education builds key skills and attitudes for Culture of Lawfulness

There are a number of key social and emotional skills that are built and nurtured through GCE. Learning rests on the three domains of learning: cognitive, behavioural and socio-emotional[21]. Of particular relevance are the set of socio-emotional skills, also referred to in the literature as non-cognitive skills. Research has shown that these skills can be shaped through education, and they have long-reaching consequences, beyond schooling, on a number of important aspects of social progress including social cohesion[22] [23].

Among the cognitive components are the knowledge and thinking needed to better understand the global world, including its governance structure. Behavioural domain includes appropriate conduct, social and political engagement, and application of knowledge. Learners should be able to recognise and examine how beliefs and values can influence politics and political decision making, and have a critical view on social justice and civic engagement. Socio-emotional aspects are meant to help learners to develop affectively, psychosocially and physically so that they can live together with others respectfully and peacefully[24].

In order to foster learning in the classroom UNESCO[25] also distinguishes key attributes that GCE aims to develop in learners in line with the three domains mentioned above. Learners are to be informed and critically-socially connected, respectful of diversity, ethically responsible and engaged.

Complementing the above-mentioned work, the Global Citizenship Education Working Group, which was composed of representatives from different international organisations (including UNESCO) and research institutes, distinguished eight key global citizenship competencies[26]. Among them are:

Empathy;
– Critical thinking and problem solving;
– Ability to communicate and collaborate with others;
– Conflict resolution;

Development (ESD), Background paper prepared for the 2016 Global Education Monitoring Report, UNESCO, Paris 2016; UNESCO, 2016…, *op. cit.*

21   UNESCO, Global Citizenship Education: Topics and Learning Objectives, UNESCO, Paris 2015.

22   M. Almlund, A. L. Duckworth, J. J. Heckman, T. D. Kautz, Personality Psychology and Economics, (in:) E. Hanushek, S. Machin, L. Woessman (ed), Handbook of the Economics of Education. Amsterdam 2011, p. 1-181.

23   K. Miyamoto, M. C. Huerta, K. Kubacka, Fostering Social and Emotional Skills for Well-Being and Social Progress, "European Journal of Education" 2015, vol. 50, no. 2, p. 147-59.

24   UNESCO, 2015…, *op. cit.*

25   *Ibidem.*

26   Center for Universal Education, Measuring Global Citizenship Education. A Collection of Practices and Tools. New York 2017.

– Sense and security of identity;
– Shared universal values (human rights, peace, justice, etc.);
– Respect for diversity and intercultural understanding;
– Recognition of global issues and interconnectedness (including social, environmental and economic).

These competencies are clearly related to building a culture of peace and lawfulness, as evident in the explicit mention of respect for diversity, human rights or interconnectedness, to name just a few. At the core of the frameworks presented above is always the idea of teaching individuals how to be responsive citizens in the interconnected global world, learning from and respecting other people's cultures and experiences and engaged in the causes of peace and social justice.

Cross-country research, used to inform monitoring of target 4.7, looked at the inclusion of GCE and Education for Sustainable Development (ESD), around the world. It analyses the coverage of the GCE themes in education focused on the extent to which national curricula and student textbooks cover the most prevalent areas related to GCE[27]. In terms of the national curricula frameworks of the 78 countries monitored in 2005-2015, human rights was the most prevalent subject, including discussion of democracy, freedom and social justice[28]. Analyses of cross-national databases containing hundreds of history, civic education, social studies and geography textbooks covering different periods of time, have shown that, on average, the topics of human rights, global citizenship, gender equality, and multiculturalism and social diversity have been generally increasing since the mid-twentieth century[29].

5. Appropriate teacher training programmes are of vital importance to GCE

Teachers need to be adequately trained in order to be prepared to nurture global citizenship views in their students. Teacher training programmes can generally be divided into initial teacher education programmes, which take place prior to teachers taking on their professional duties; and ongoing professional development programmes, which take place while teachers are already working. The latter can be addressed to teachers at all levels of experience, and can vary in formats and in duration.

---

27   UNESCO, 2016…, *op. cit.*
28   IBE, Global Monitoring of Target 4.7: Themes in National Curriculum Frameworks, Background paper for the 2016 Global Education Monitoring Report UNESCO, Paris, 2014.
29   P. Bromley, J. Lerch, J. Jimenez, Education for Global Citizenship Education & Sustainable Development: Content in Social Science Textbooks, Background paper for the 2016 Global Education Monitoring Report, UNESCO, Paris 2016.

GCE tends to be associated with more learner-centred approaches, which aim to actively involve students as agents in the process of learning. However, in many countries teacher training still focuses on more traditional approaches that represent a transmissive, more passive mode of teaching and pedagogy. A review of initial teacher education programmes worldwide found that the coverage of GCE themes in ITE tends to be limited in scale and often originates from teacher trainers and as part of specific modules in teachers' universities. In terms of continuous professional development (CPD), the review found more evidence of GCE themes being covered in these programmes than in ITE. These initiatives are often not done systematically and are initiated because of interests of teachers or school leaders, dependent on the availability of GCE-related CPD[30].

However, incorporating these themes into teacher training, on any level, is not enough to make sure that the themes will be effectively taught to students. Building teacher motivation and positive teacher attitudes towards global citizenship is key. Teachers can be agents of change both in their classrooms and beyond, by building responsive and open learning environments[31]. However, a teachers' ability to effectively deliver the material to students can also be limited by the wider environment and lack of system support. Teachers cannot be held accountable for things beyond their control[32]. For instance, teaching effectiveness can be affected by lack of materials or textbooks, or inadequate teaching and learning materials. In addition, and despite official undertakings, in many countries there is a tension between meetings global commitments and preserving national identity and values[33]. Some countries even dismiss the global trans-national agenda as being too far idealistic and too removed from reality[34].

In Europe, many countries provide competency guides for teachers and school teachers as part of civic education frameworks and some of them can include global citizenship. For instance, in Switzerland the Guide Education *Citoyenneté Mondiale* provides a pedagogical guide for schools and teachers on citizenship and global citizenship relevant to all subjects: the guide also includes examples of appropriate pedagogical approaches[35].

---

30   D. Bourn, F. Hunt, P. Bamber, A review of Education for Sustainable Development and Global Citizenship Education in Teacher Education, Background paper for the 2017/8 Global Education Monitoring Report, UNESCO, Paris 2018.

31   D. Bourn, Teachers as agents of social change, "International Journal of Development Education and Global Learning" 2015, vol. 7, no. 3, p. 63-77.

32   UNESCO, Global Education Monitoring Report 2017/8. Accountability in Education: Meeting our Commitments, UNESCO, Paris 2018.

33   UNESCO, 2016…, *op. cit.*

34   European Commission/EACEA/Eurydice…, *op. cit.*

35   *Ibidem.*

The UNESCO Guidelines on Global Citizenship Education[36] suggest nine topics corresponding to three learner attributes. The topics can guide teachers and school leaders to cover global citizenship themes. Regarding informed and critically learners: local, national and global systems and structures; issues affecting interaction and connectedness of communities at all levels; underlying assumptions and power dynamics. For teaching socially connected learners who are respectful of diversity, the selected topics cover discussions of: different levels of identity; different communities people belong to and their interconnectedness; respect for diversity. Topics relating to ethical responsibility and engagement include actions that can be taken individually and collectively; ethically responsible behaviour, getting engaged and taking action. These topics can all be applied in an age-appropriate fashion for all learners.

6. Conclusion

The relationship between education and culture of lawfulness is a complex and multifaceted one. Beyond the simple fact of obtaining an education, the content of education makes a difference. Global Citizenship Education and the skills it aims to promote offer a promising education programme which can promote culture of lawfulness around the world. However, practical research on best practice in terms of implementation of global citizenship learning programmes and their impact on culture of lawfulness is still largely missing. Future initiatives should address several gaps in the literature and evidence base. More evidence is needed to understand the current knowledge base of teacher trainers and their needs in terms of being able to best develop the potential of teachers. In addition, more evidence on effective teacher training programmes around the world, both on the pre-service and in-service level is essential for policy-makers and practitioners looking to design new programmes.

In addition, forthcoming research should address questions about the adaptability of global citizenship education into different cultural contexts, including in places where tensions with national identities might exist. More evidence is needed in terms of examples of effective global citizenship education pedagogies that can build key social and emotional skills in learners and their relationship with culture of lawfulness, particularly in terms of examples from different countries and effects over time. In this context, the Fourteenth United Nations Congress on Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice, with its coverage of education and youth engagement as a way to build societal resilience to crime, offers a promising opportunity for exchanges and political engagement which can spur more evidence.

---

36   UNESCO, 2015…, *op. cit.*

7. Questions

– What can policy-makers, school leaders, teachers and other stakeholders do to promote and support learners' development of social and emotional skills for Culture of Lawfulness? How can these skills be developed in most appropriate ways at different stages of education, starting from early childhood education?

– How to best train teachers and teacher trainers in order to prepare them to uphold and build Culture of Lawfulness in schools? What are good examples of pre- and in-service teacher training programmes, which promote GCE and Culture of Lawfulness, around the world?

– What are the most effective GCE classroom pedagogies to promote Culture of Lawfulness? To what extent are they culture-specific?

– In countries with growing nationalistic sentiments, how can GCE be integrated in national curricula in order to strengthen respect for differences? How can education help resolve the tension between national citizenship and global citizenship approaches?

– How can the Fourteenth United Nations Congress on Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice help drive concrete policies and initiatives in countries willing to promote GCE for Culture of Lawfulness?

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Akar B., Developing a Monitoring Instrument to Measure Extracurricular and Non-Formal Activities which Promote Global Citizenship Education (GCED) and Education for Sustainable Development (ESD), Background paper prepared for the 2016 Global Education Monitoring Report, UNESCO, Paris 2016.

Almlund M., Duckworth A. L., Heckman J. J., Kautz T. D., Personality Psychology and Economics, (in:) E. Hanushek, S. Machin, L. Woessman (ed.), Handbook of the Economics of Education. Amsterdam 2011.

Bourn D., Teachers as agents of social change, "International Journal of Development Education and Global Learning" 2015, vol. 7, no. 3.

Bourn D., Hunt F., Bamber P., A review of Education for Sustainable Development and Global Citizenship Education in Teacher Education, Background paper for the 2017/8 Global Education Monitoring Report, UNESCO, Paris 2018.

Bromley P., Lerch J., Jimenez J., Education for Global Citizenship Education & Sustainable Development: Content in Social Science Textbooks, Background paper for the 2016 Global Education Monitoring Report, UNESCO, Paris 2016.

Buonanno P., Leonida L., Education and crime: Evidence from Italian regions, "Applied Economics Letters" 2006, vol. 13.

Burde D., Kapit A., Wahl R. L., Guven O., Skarpeteig M. I., Education in Emergencies: A Review of Theory and Research, "Review of Educational Research" 2016, vol. 87, no. 3.

Center for Uniersal Education, Measuring Global Citizenship Educaiton. A Collection of Practices and Tools. New York 2017.

E/CN.15/2018/CRP.1, Discussion Guide for the Fourteenth United Nations Congress on Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice, Vienna, 9.02.2018.

European Commission/EACEA/Eurydice, Citizenship Education at School in Europe 2017, Eurydice Report, Luxembourg, 2017.

Hjalmarsson R., Holmlund H., Lindquist M., The Effect of Education on Criminal Convictions and Incarceration: Causal Evidence from Micro-Data, "Centre for Economic Policy Research Discussion Paper no. 8646" 2011.

Hjalmarsson R., Lochner L., The Impact of Education on Crime: International Evidence, CEDifo DICE Report 2/2012, Washington, D.C. 2014.

IBE, Global Monitoring of Target 4.7: Themes in National Curriculum Frameworks, Background paper for the 2016 Global Education Monitoring Report UNESCO, Paris, 2014.

King E., From Classroom to Conflict in Rwanda, New York 2014.

Macartan H., Weinstein J. M., Who Fights? The Determinants of Participation in Civil War. "American Journal of Political Science" 2008, vol. 52, no. 2.

Miyamoto K., Huerta M. C., Kubacka K., Fostering Social and Emotional Skills for Well-Being and Social Progress, "European Journal of Education" 2015, vol. 50, no. 2.

Quinney R., The Way of Peace: On Crime, Suffering and Service, (in:) H. Pepinsky and R. Quinney (ed), Criminology as Peacemaking. Bloomington 1991, p. 3-13.

UNESCO, Global Citizenship Education: Preparing Learners for the Challenges of the 21st Century, UNESCO, Paris 2014.

UNESCO, Global Citizenship Education: Topics and Learning Objectives, UNESCO, Paris 2015.

UNESCO, Global Education Monitoring Report 2016. Education for People and Planet: Creatng Sustainable Futures for All, UNESCO, Paris 2016.

UNESCO, Global Education Monitoring Report 2017/8. Accountability in Education: Meeting our Commitments, UNESCO, Paris 2018.

UNODC, Global Citizenship Education for a Culture of Lawfulness initiative begins its work,

UNODC, Vienna 2018, https://www.unodc.org/dohadeclaration/en/news/2018/03/global-citizenship-education-for-a-culture-of-lawfulness-initiative-begins-its-work.html (17.05.2018).

USIFR, Teaching Intolerance in Pakistan: Religious Bias in Public School Textbooks, Islamabad 2016.